
This is the **accepted version** of the article:

Wang, Weiqi; Wang, Chun; Sardans i Galobart, Jordi; [et al.]. «Multiple trade-offs between maximizing yield and minimizing greenhouse gas production in Chinese rice croplands». *Land degradation & development*, Vol. 31, Issue 10 (June 2020), p. 1287-1299. DOI 10.1002/ldr.3507

This version is available at <https://ddd.uab.cat/record/222641>

under the terms of the  **CC BY** COPYRIGHT license

1 **MULTIPLE TRADEOFFS BETWEEN MAXIMIZING YIELD AND**
2 **MINIMIZING GREENHOUSE GAS PRODUCTION IN CHINESE RICE**
3 **CROPLANDS**

4

5 Weiqi Wang^{1,2,3,4*#}, Chun Wang^{1,2#}, Jordi Sardans^{3,4*}, Yunying Fang⁵, Bhupinder Pal
6 Singh⁵, Huaru Wang⁶, Xiaoting Huang^{1,2}, Congsheng Zeng^{1,2}, Chuan Tong^{1,2}, Josep
7 Peñuelas^{3,4}

8 ¹ Key Laboratory of Humid Subtropical Eco-geographical Process, Ministry of Education,
9 Fujian Normal University, Fuzhou 350007, China

10 ² Institute of Geography, Fujian Normal University, Fuzhou 350007, China

11 ³ CSIC, Global Ecology Unit CREAM-CEAB-CSIC-UAB. 08913 Cerdanyola del Vallès.
12 Catalonia, Spain

13 ⁴ CREAM. 08913 Cerdanyola del Vallès. Catalonia, Spain

14 ⁵ NSW Department of Primary Industries, Elizabeth Macarthur Agricultural Institute,
15 Menangle, NSW 2568, Australia

16 ⁶ Yellow River Institute of Hydraulic Research, Zhengzhou 450003, China

17

18 **Corresponding author:** W. Wang, Key Laboratory of Humid Subtropical Eco-
19 geographical Process, Ministry of Education, Fujian Normal University, Fuzhou 350007,
20 China, Institute of Geography, Fujian Normal University, Fuzhou 350007, China. Email:
21 wangweiqi15@163.com;

22 J. Sardans, CSIC, Global Ecology Unit CREAM-CSIC-UAB, 08913 Cerdanyola del
23 Vallès, Catalonia, Spain, CREAM, 08913 Cerdanyola del Vallès, Catalonia, Spain. Email:
24 j.sardans@creaf.uab.es

25 **# Equal contribution**

26 **Running title:**

27 Tradeoffs between yield and greenhouse gas production

28

29 **ABSTRACT**

30 Globally, paddy fields are a major anthropogenic source of greenhouse gas (GHG)
31 emissions from agriculture. There is, however, limited understanding of relationships
32 between GHG production with fertilizer management, rice varieties, and soil variables.
33 This information is crucial for minimizing the climatic impacts of rice agriculture. Here,
34 we examined the relationships between soil GHG production and management practices
35 throughout China. The current doses of N-fertilizer (73-272 kg ha⁻¹) were negatively
36 correlated with rice yield and with CO₂ or CH₄ production, and positively correlated with
37 N₂O production, thus suggesting N-overfertilization. Impacts on soil traits such as
38 decreasing pH or the availabilities of other nutrients could be underlying these
39 relationships. Rice yield was highest and GHG production was lowest at sites using
40 intermediate levels of P- and K-fertilization. CO₂ and CH₄ production and emissions were
41 positively related with soil water content. The yield was higher and N₂O productions were
42 lower at the sites with japonica rice. Our results strongly suggest that current high doses
43 of N-fertilizers could be reduced to thus avoid the negative effects of excessive N input
44 on GHG production without any immediate risk of rice production loss. Current
45 intermediate doses of P- and K-fertilization should be adopted across China to further
46 improve rice production without the risk of GHG emissions. The use of different rice
47 varieties and strategies of water management should be re-examined in relation to crop
48 production and GHG mitigation.

49 **KEYWORDS:** paddy field, greenhouse gases, yields, nitrogen, phosphorus, soil
50 nutrients

51 **1. INTRODUCTION**

52 Rice currently feeds more than 50% of the global population (Haque, Kim, Ali & Kim,
53 2015), but production will need to increase by 40% by the end of 2030 worldwide to meet
54 the demand for food from the growing population (FAO, 2009). Sustaining soil fertility
55 and increasing rice yields are therefore of utmost importance. An increased nutrient
56 supply can stimulate the growth and grain yield of rice plants (Ali, Oh & Kim, 2008;
57 Wang et al., 2014) but can also influence the potential of paddy fields to produce and emit
58 greenhouse gases (GHG). Globally, paddy fields are a major anthropogenic source of
59 greenhouse gas (GHG) emissions from agriculture (Tan, 2011). Paddy fields are very
60 important sources of GHG, especially methane (CH₄) and nitrous oxide (N₂O) (Myhre et
61 al., 2013), so minimizing the release of these very potent GHG could contribute to
62 mitigating their adverse impacts on climate change (Li et al., 2006). Chinese GHG
63 emissions from agricultural systems account for ~ 40% of Chinese GHG emissions, hence
64 requiring detailed investigations. Furthermore, since sixty percent of the Chinese
65 population depends on rice-based food, so protecting China's rice production for food
66 security is important (Zhu, 2006).

67 There is, however, limited understanding of relationships between GHG production
68 with fertilizer management, rice varieties, and soil variables. This information is crucial
69 for minimizing the climatic impacts of rice agriculture, especially for the agricultural
70 sustainable development in China. Improving the status of soil nutrients in paddy fields
71 for improved rice yield while decreasing GHG emissions, or at least not increasing it, is
72 a challenging option. However, intense fertilization can also induce rises in GHG
73 emissions in paddy soils (Fan et al., 2016), and great soil nutrient concentration also can
74 be related to GHG emissions in paddy soils (Wang et al., 2017a). Rice crops in China are
75 frequently overfertilized (Cheng & Li, 2007) so a general analysis of the relationships of

76 fertilization and soil traits with GHG emissions and crop yield is necessary to detect the
77 level of over-fertilization, GHG emissions and yield, and moreover, to improve the future
78 management of the sustainable development of rice agriculture. Here, we examined the
79 relationships between soil GHG production and management practices throughout China.

80 Most current studies associating GHG emissions from paddy fields with soil
81 properties have been conducted at a single location by applying different treatments that
82 modify soil properties (Wassmann et al., 1998; Wang et al., 2014). Several strategies for
83 managing rice crops, such as from fertilizer and herbicide application to straw or water
84 management, are aiming to increase rice production. However, such management
85 strategies may also increase or decrease CO₂, CH₄ and/or N₂O emissions (Li et al., 2005,
86 2013; Liu et al., 2016; Jiang, Chen, Sun, Song & Huang, 2015; Launio, Asis, Manalili &
87 Javier, 2016; Trinh et al., 2017; Wang et al., 2016c; Zhang et al., 2016a,b; Jiang, Chen,
88 Sun, Song & Huang, 2015; Launio, Asis, Manalili & Javier, 2016; Trinh et al., 2017;
89 Wang et al., 2016c; Zhang et al., 2016a,b). Many of these studies have reported links
90 between GHG emissions and various soil traits, such as pH (Wang et al., 2017a), redox
91 potential, (Fan et al., 2016; Wang et al., 2017b), salinity (Olsson et al., 2015), sulfate
92 concentration (Dong et al., 2011; Theint, Susuki, Ono & Bellingrath-Kimura, 2014; Wang
93 et al., 2017b), N content (Zhu, Zhang & Cai, 2011; Zheng, Zhang & Cai, 2013; Zhao et
94 al., 2015; Wang et al., 2017c) and soil P concentration (Adhya, Pattnaik, Satpathy,
95 Kumaraswamy & Sethunathan, 1998; Zheng, Zhang & Cai, 2013; Sheng et al., 2016).
96 However, only few studies have tested the differences in GHG productions and emissions
97 at sites with different soil traits and management strategies, including fertilization.
98 Studying soil conditions on a large scale, including coastal and inland paddy soils at large
99 regional scales, and their relationships with GHG productions and emissions are thus
100 warranted for increasing rice production while controlling GHG emissions.

101 We hypothesized that different fertilization practices, strategies of rice-crop
102 management, rice varieties, concentrations of soil carbon (C) and other nutrients, salinity
103 or/and pH would explain a large part of the differences in GHG emissions and yield
104 among sites, especially, the fertilization amount increment will increase the GHG
105 emissions but not the yield. Our results will provide information for improving strategies
106 and managing soil conditions toward more favorable traits to avoid a possible increase in
107 GHG production without yield loss. We pursued this objective by determining (1) the
108 relationships among fertilization dose, soil GHG production and rice yield in China, (2)
109 the relationships among GHG production, rice variety and environmental traits, such as
110 region (sites), location (coastal vs. inland) and cropping system (single or double) on these
111 relationships.

112 **2. MATERIALS AND METHODS**

113 2.1 Study area

114 This study was conducted throughout China (Figure 1). China has 2.45×10^7 ha of
115 cultivated rice, and 90% of the paddies are in the subtropics. China has a large area of
116 paddy rice, diverse soil types and different tillage and fertilizer management practices, all
117 of which may affect the content and distribution of nutrients and GHG emissions. We
118 collected the soils in the whole China rice cultivation areas choosing sites with contrasting
119 fertilization management. The studied ranges of fertilization were 73 -272 kg ha⁻¹ for N
120 fertilizer, 48-150 kg ha⁻¹ for P₂O₅, and 45-270 kg ha⁻¹ for K₂O. The main characteristics
121 of the different studied sites are showed in Table S1. To analyze the role of sea proximity
122 we separated the studied sites between inland and coastal rice crops depending on the
123 distance to sea line; when less than 20 km was considered coastal paddy field and more
124 than 20 km was considered inland paddy field. To analyze the role of fertilization intensity
125 we classified the distinct sites as low, intermediate and high intensity fertilized. In the

126 case of N-fertilization: Low <100 kg N ha⁻¹ y⁻¹, intermediate between 100-150 kg N ha⁻¹
127 y⁻¹ and high intensity >150 kg N ha⁻¹ y⁻¹. In the case of P-fertilization: Low<60 kg P₂O₅
128 ha⁻¹ y⁻¹, intermediate between 60-75 kg P₂O₅ ha⁻¹ y⁻¹and high intensity>75 kg P₂O₅ ha⁻¹
129 y⁻¹. In the case of K-fertilization: Low <60 kg K₂O ha⁻¹ y⁻¹, intermediate between 60-70
130 kg K₂O ha⁻¹ y⁻¹ and high intensity >70 kg K₂O ha⁻¹ y⁻¹.

131

132 2.2 Collection and measurement of soil samples

133 Soil samples were collected from 34 randomly selected paddy fields and five replicated
134 plots throughout China using a small core sampler (length and diameter of 0.5 and 0.1 m,
135 respectively) from the plowed (0-15 cm) soil layer in October to November 2015 (Figure
136 1). A total of 170 samples (34 sites × 1 soil layer × 5 replicates) were thus collected. We
137 attributed China into six regions for this study: Northeast China, North China, East China,
138 Center and South China, Southwest China and Northwest China (Sun, Huang, Zhang &
139 Yu, 2010). Moreover, the sampling site characteristics and paddy field management were
140 also investigated. The collected soil samples were also used for all analyses. The samples
141 were air-dried, and roots and visible plant debris were removed. Total C and N contents
142 were measured using a Vario EL III Elemental Analyzer (Elementar Scientific
143 Instruments, Hanau, Germany, Wang *et al.*, 2015a; Wang *et al.*, 2016a,b). Labile organic-
144 carbon (LOC) content was determined by digestion with 333 mM KMnO₄ (Wang, Lai,
145 Wang, Oan & Zheng, 2015b), while NH₄⁺ and NO₃⁻ were determined by extracting the
146 soils with 2 M KCl (Lu, 1999). Available N content was the sum of NH₄⁺ and NO₃⁻. The
147 total P content was determined, first by perchloric-acid digestion and then using a
148 sequence flow analyzer (San++, SKALAR Corporation production, Breda, The
149 Netherlands). To determine soil P availability, we used the Mehlich extraction method
150 and then using a sequence flow analyzer (San++, SKALAR Corporation production,

151 Breda, The Netherlands).

152 The soil CO₂, CH₄ and N₂O productions were determined using anaerobic
153 incubation consistent with soils under water saturation (Wang et al., 2015a). Thirty grams
154 of fresh soil of the five core samples for each site were placed in 120-mL incubation
155 bottles, and two volumes of distilled water were added. The bottles were purged with N₂
156 for 2 min to replace the O₂ and were then sealed with a rubber stopper and incubated at
157 25 °C for 3 d. Five milliliters of gas were extracted from the headspaces each day, about
158 24 h interval in four times during incubation: 0, 24, 48 and 72 hours during incubation
159 experiments. This method has been successfully used in several previous studies
160 (Wassmann et al., 1998; Wang et al., 2017b). We also use the method, of Xu et al., 2016
161 to calculate annual gas emissions from some days (in our case 3 days) of sampling (Xu et
162 al., 2016).

163 The soil CO₂ and CH₄ concentrations in the samples of headspace air were
164 determined by gas chromatography (Shimadzu GC-2010, Kyoto, Japan). The soil N₂O
165 concentrations in these samples were determined by gas chromatography (Shimadzu GC-
166 2014, Kyoto, Japan) using a stainless-steel Porapak Q column (2 m length, 4 mm OD,
167 80/100 mesh). A methane conversion furnace, flame ionization detector (FID) and
168 electron capture detector (ECD) were used for determining the CO₂, CH₄ and N₂O
169 concentrations, respectively. The operating temperatures of the column, injector and
170 detector were adjusted to 45, 100 and 280 °C, respectively, for determining the CO₂
171 concentrations; to 70, 200 and 200 °C, respectively, for determining the CH₄
172 concentrations; and to 70, 200 and 320 °C, respectively, for determining the N₂O
173 concentrations. Helium (99.999% purity) was used as a carrier gas (30 mL min⁻¹), and a
174 make-up gas (95% argon and 5% CH₄) was used for the ECD. The gas chromatograph
175 was calibrated before and after each set of measurements using 503, 1030 and 2980 µL

176 CO₂ L⁻¹ in He; 1.01, 7.99 and 50.5 μL CH₄ L⁻¹ in He and 0.2, 0.6 and 1.0 μL N₂O L⁻¹ in
177 He (CRM/RM information center of China) as primary standards (Wang *et al.*, 2015c, d).
178 We used linear equations for calculating CO₂, CH₄ and N₂O productions.

179 Other soil variables were also analyzed. Bulk density was measured using three 15 ×
180 3 cm cores (Wang *et al.*, 2016b), and was estimated by core mass dry weight divided by
181 core volume, and represent the averaged bulk density of 0-15 cm. Soil water content was
182 measured by the drying method (Lu, 1999). pH was measured with a PHS-3C pH meter
183 (Orion Scientific Instruments, Minnesota, USA) and salinity was measured using a
184 2265FS EC Meter (Spectrum Technologies Inc., Paxinos, USA; Wang *et al.*, 2016b). Soil
185 particle size (percent clay, silt and sand contents) was measured by a Mastersizer 2000
186 laser particle-size analyzer (Malvern Scientific Instruments, Malvern, UK; Wang *et al.*,
187 2016b).

188

189 2.3 Determination of soil C and nutrient contents

190

191 The total C, N and P contents, and labile organic carbon (LOC), available N, available P,
192 NH₄⁺-N and NO₃⁻-N contents in the 0-15 cm soil profile were estimated by following the
193 approach of Mishra, Ussiri & Lal (2010):

$$194 \quad C_S = \sum C_m \times \rho_b \times D$$

195

196 where C_S is the total C, N or P content or LOC, available N, available P, NH₄⁺-N or NO₃⁻
197 -N content (kg m⁻²), C_m is the total C, N or P content or LOC, available N, available P,
198 NH₄⁺-N or NO₃⁻-N content (g kg⁻¹), ρ_b is the bulk density (kg m⁻³), D is the thickness of
199 each soil layer (0.15 m).

200 The total C, N and P contents, and LOC, available N, available P, NH₄⁺-N and NO₃⁻

201 -N contents were calculated for each region by multiplying area content and areas of each
202 paddy distribution. The contents for each measured variables across China were
203 calculated as the sum for all regions.

204

205 2.4 Determination of soil CO₂, CH₄ and N₂O productions

206 We used linear regressions for calculating soil CO₂, CH₄ and N₂O productions
207 (Wassmann *et al.*, 1998):

$$208 \quad P = \frac{dc}{dt} \cdot \frac{V_H}{W_S} \cdot \frac{MW}{MV} \cdot \frac{T_{st}}{T_{st} + T}$$

209 where P is the rate of CO₂, CH₄ or N₂O production ($\mu\text{g}^{-1} \text{g}^{-1} \text{d}^{-1}$), dc/dt is the recorded
210 change in the mixing ratio of CO₂, CH₄ and N₂O in the headspace over time (mmol mol^{-1}
211 d^{-1}), V_H is the volume of the headspace (L), W_S is the dry weight of the soil (g), MW is
212 the molecular weight of CO₂, CH₄ or N₂O (g), MV is the molecular volume (L), T is the
213 temperature (K) and T_{st} is the standard temperature (K).

214 The potential productions of CO₂, CH₄ and N₂O, calculated as the average
215 productions per unit area per year [productions rate \times soil depth \times bulk density \times days of
216 the year (365 d in 2015)]. The productions of CO₂, CH₄ and N₂O were calculated for each
217 region as average production per unit area per year \times area of the paddy fields in the
218 production region. The GHG productions for all of China was calculated as the sum of
219 productions form all paddy regions.

220

221 2.5 Statistical analyses

222 One-way ANOVAs with N-, P- and K-fertilization doses categorical (low, intermediate
223 and high intensity), regions, inland-coastal environments and cropping systems as
224 independent variables and gas production variables, and yield as a dependent continuous

225 variable were conducted with Bonferroni post hoc tests. The data were checked for
226 normality and homogeneity of variance, and if necessary, were log-transformed. We used
227 the Benjamini–Hochberg procedure to control the rate of false discovery (Benjamini and
228 Hochberg 1995) to analyze the relationships between gas emissions and all the studied
229 environmental soil and climate variables. The different individual analyses were listed in
230 rank order according with their ascending P-value. Thereafter, for each single analyses
231 each P-value was divided by the total number of test and thereafter multiplied by the false
232 discovery rate (habitually 0.25) then the values below 0.05 were considered as significant.
233 We also used Tukey’s method (Tukey, 1977) to detect and remove outliers.

234 We also performed multivariate statistical analyses. We used principal component
235 analyses (PCAs) to determine the overall differences of the soil variables and CO₂, CH₄
236 and N₂O productions rates, and annual accumulated emissions among fertilizer doses. We
237 used all variables given the scarce multicollinearity existing among variables (see Table
238 S1), with no $R^2 > 0.6$ between any pairwise variables. We have also estimated VIF for each
239 independent fixed variables in the mixed models. We conducted one-way ANOVAs with
240 Bonferroni post hoc tests of the scores of the first PC axis to determine differences among
241 the treatments. We then used general discriminant analyses (GDAs) to determine the
242 overall differences of soil traits; CO₂, CH₄ and N₂O productions rates and annual
243 accumulated emissions and yield among fertilizer doses, and productivities among sites
244 with different yields. Discriminant analyses consist of a supervised statistical algorithm
245 that derives an optimal separation between groups established a priori by maximizing
246 between-group variance while minimizing within-group variance (Raamsdonk et al.,
247 2001). GDA is thus an appropriate tool for identifying the variables most responsible for
248 differences among groups. The GDAs and PCAs were performed using Statistica 8.0
249 (StatSoft, Inc., Tulsa, USA). Before conducting these multivariate analyses, we selected

250 the sampling adequacy of individuals and the set of variables by the Barlett's test of
251 sphericity (<0.05) and the Kaiser-Meyer-Olkin measure (>0.50). We removed the variables
252 with communality values < 0.5 and perform the PCA and DGA analyses with the
253 variables with communality > 0.5 . To perform these sampling adequacy analyses we used
254 the package psych (Revelle, 2010).

255 Significant differences in CO₂, CH₄ and N₂O productions among does of fertilizers,
256 number of crops, crop location (inland vs. coastal) and soil traits were tested by general
257 mixed models using location with topography, site and plot as random nested factors. We
258 used the "lme" function of the "nlme" R package (Pinheiro, Bates, DebRoy, Sakar &
259 Core, 2016). Non-normally distributed variables were log-transformed. We chose the best
260 model for each dependent variable using the Akaike information criterion (AIC). We used
261 the MuMIn (Barton, 2012) R package in the mixed models to estimate the percentage of
262 the variance explained by the model. We conducted Tukey's post hoc tests to detect
263 significant differences in the analyses for more than two communities using the
264 "multcomp" (Hothorn, Pretz & Wersfall, 2013) R package with the "glht" function. The
265 relationships of each soil variable with CO₂, CH₄ and N₂O productions were determined
266 by simple regressions using Statistica 6.0 (StatSoft, Inc. Tulsa, USA). We used the
267 Benjamini-Hochberg procedure to control for rates of false discovery (Benjamini &
268 Hochberg, 1995).

269 We used structural equation modeling (SEM) to study the total effects of fertilizer
270 doses on accumulated gas emissions by both direct and indirect effects of soil traits. We
271 fit the different models using the SEM R package (Fox, Nie & Byrnes, 2013) and
272 determined the minimum adequate model using AIC. Standard errors and significance
273 levels (P values) of the total, direct and indirect effects were calculated using
274 bootstrapping (1200 repetitions) (Davison, Hinkley & Schechtman, 1986; Mitchell-Olds,

275 1986).

276

277 **3. RESULTS**

278 3.1 Effects of fertilization doses, regions, rice variety, inland-coastal environments and
279 cropping systems on soil GHG productions and rice yield

280 One-way ANOVAs with N-, P- and K-fertilization doses as independent categorical (low,
281 intermediate and high intensity) variables and gas production variables, and yield as a
282 dependent continuous variable, indicated that the lowest levels of N fertilization (<100
283 kg N ha⁻¹ y⁻¹) were associated with the highest annual yields. However, the highest levels
284 of N fertilization (>150 kg N ha⁻¹ y⁻¹) were associated with the lowest annual yields
285 (Figures 2d and S1). The lowest doses of N fertilizer were associated with the highest soil
286 CO₂ and CH₄ productions, and the lowest N₂O productions, with the opposite patterns at
287 the highest doses of N fertilizer. The intermediate doses of P (60-75 kg P₂O₅ ha⁻¹ y⁻¹) and
288 K (60-70 kg K₂O ha⁻¹ y⁻¹) fertilizers were the best, because they were associated with the
289 highest yields and the lowest CO₂ and CH₄ productions (Figures 3a,b, S2, 4a,b and S3).
290 The correlations among all the studied variables were shown in Table S2.

291 The balance between yield and GHG production was worst in the East China rice
292 crops, with the highest productions of CO₂, CH₄ and N₂O and the lowest annual yield
293 (Figures 5, and S4). Coastal rice crops have higher CO₂ and CH₄ production (Figure
294 6a,b, S5a,b) and lower yield than inland rice crops (Figure 6d). Total annual yield was
295 notably similar at the sites with one and two annual rice crops (Figure 7d). The CO₂
296 production rates were higher at sites with one annual crop than at sites with two annual
297 crops (Figure S6a,c).

298 We excluded hybrid and glutinous rice varieties from the analysis of the effects of
299 rice variety, because both were only at one site each. We focused on japonica and Hsien

300 rice varieties, which were the main varieties planted at the sites. On average, the yield
301 was higher and N₂O productions were lower at the sites with japonica rice (Figure S7).

302

303 3.2 Gas productions and environmental traits

304 We observed scarce relationships with studied gas emissions and production with the
305 studied soil variables, the most strong was the positive relationships between total soil N
306 concentrations and CO₂ emission and production and between soil water content and
307 methane emission and production (Table S2). The variables that mainly loaded on PC1
308 (correlation >0.4) were Soil N concentration, LOC soil extractable NH₄⁺ and NO₃⁻
309 concentrations, soil pH, soil salinity, soil bulk density, sand %, MAP, soil NO₃⁻ content,
310 CO₂ emission rates and yield. The variables that mainly loaded PC1 were soil total C, N
311 and P concentrations, soil P availability, soil NO₃⁻ concentrations and contents, and soil
312 salinity. A PCA of all available data also indicated that the rice crops under the low to
313 intermediate doses of N fertilizer, and intermediate doses of P and K fertilizers had the
314 highest yields and lower CO₂ and CH₄ productions (Figure 8a). Whereas, crops receiving
315 high doses of N and K fertilizers had the lowest annual yields and the highest CO₂ and
316 CH₄ productions, as shown along the PC1 axis (Figure 8b). The PCAs indicated that the
317 North China and Northwest China rice crops were plotted by the two first PC axes toward
318 higher yield and soil P availability, total P content, C:N ratio and sand content, and toward
319 lower soil N:P ratio, labile C:N ratio and labile C:P ratio and lower CO₂ and CH₄
320 productions (Figure 8b). Fields in the East China, Center and South China, Southwest
321 China regions had opposite patterns.

322 Coastal rice crops have higher CO₂ and CH₄ emissions and lower yield than inland
323 rice crops. This was associated with higher soil N, water and clay contents in coastal rice
324 crops (Figure 8c). Figure 8d shows the overall differences in the environmental variables

325 between the sites with one and two annual crops. These two groups of sites were clearly
326 separated along the PC1 axis, with single-crop sites plotted toward higher annual yields
327 and soil P contents, salinities, C:N ratios and pHs, whereas the double-crop sites were
328 plotted toward higher soil N, water and LOC contents and N:P ratios, and higher CO₂
329 productions.

330 The best mixed models (based on a low AIC and the highest R² and
331 parsimoniousness), with rice variety and environmental traits as fixed independent
332 variables; location, topography, site and plot as random factors; and GHG productions as
333 dependent variables, indicated that 26% of the total variance of annual accumulated CO₂
334 productions was explained by the length of the growth period, soil water content and bulk
335 density (Table S3). Thirty-nine percent of the total variance of CO₂ productions rates was
336 explained by the growth-period length, soil water content and P-fertilizer dose. Forty-
337 seven and 50% of the total variance of annual accumulated CH₄ productions and CH₄
338 productions rate, respectively, were explained by the growth-period length, soil water
339 content, water source (river or groundwater), rice variety, bulk density, total soil N content
340 and P-fertilizer dose. Nineteen and 21% of the total variance of annual accumulated N₂O
341 productions and N₂O productions rate, respectively, were explained by the cropping
342 systems, soil P availability and soil NO₃⁻-N content. All six mixed models (Table S3),
343 corresponding to each of the production variables, explained >99% of the corresponding
344 total variance, while taking into account the random variables.

345

346 3.3 Relationships between annual yield and gas productions; fertilization effects

347 The GDA indicated that the crop sites with high yields generally had the highest GHG
348 productions, whereas crop sites with moderate yields generally had the lowest GHG
349 productions (Figure S8). Lower doses of N fertilizer were surprisingly associated with

350 higher yields but also with higher CH₄ productions (Figure S9), whereas intermediate
351 doses of N fertilizer were associate with higher N₂O productions, consistent with the
352 above results. Intermediate doses of P fertilizer were associated with the highest annual
353 yields and the lowest CO₂ and CH₄ productions (Figures S10), whereas intermediate
354 doses of K fertilizer were associated with the highest annual yields and the lowest CH₄
355 productions (Figures S11) also consistent with the results of the one-way ANOVAs.

356 When the productivities at the various doses of N, P and K fertilizers (yield kg⁻¹
357 fertilizer) were used as grouping dependent factors in the GDA, the sites with high N
358 productivity were associated with the highest N₂O productions, sites with intermediate N
359 productivity were associated with the highest CH₄ productions, and sites with low N
360 productivity were associated with higher CO₂ productions (Figure S12). The lowest CO₂,
361 CH₄ and N₂O productions were associated with sites with intermediate P fertilization
362 (Figure S13), and sites with intermediate K fertilization were associated with the lowest
363 CO₂ and CH₄ but not N₂O productions (Figure S14).

364

365 3.4.SEM models

366 The SEM provided further evidence of the complex relationships among fertilizer doses,
367 GHG productions and annual yield. The N fertilization had a positive direct effect on
368 GHG productions and a negative effect on annual yield, and P fertilization had the
369 opposite pattern (Figure 9), and K fertilization did not significantly affect GHG
370 productions but generally negatively affected yield (Figure 9c). The N fertilization also
371 had indirect negative effects on annual yield by increasing the amount of labile soil carbon
372 content and by lowering soil pH. We also detected a negative direct and indirect effect,
373 by decreasing soil water content, effect of bulk density on soil CO₂ productions (Figure
374 9b).

375

376

377 **4. DISCUSSION**

378 We studied potential emissions of carbon dioxide (CO₂), CH₄ and N₂O from paddy fields
379 across China, because they are the most important GHG, contributing about 80% of the
380 current global radiative forcing (Myhre et al., 2013). The statistical analyses of our
381 database of 34 field sites throughout China clearly identified a general trend to over
382 fertilization with N. The current dose of N fertilizer was negatively correlated with rice
383 yield. This correlation was exacerbated by a positive correlation between N-fertilization
384 and N₂O productions and negative correlations between N-fertilization and CO₂ and CH₄
385 productions. These results are generally consistent with previous findings, that have also
386 observed that higher N application doses had detrimental effects on yield and/or
387 increased gas emissions. Kim et al. (2016a) reported that rice yield increased with N-
388 fertilizer dose to levels of 110-130 kg N ha⁻¹ y⁻¹ and thereafter decreased at higher levels.
389 A meta-analysis of 24 field studies of rice crops in China demonstrated that N fertilization
390 increased CH₄ and N₂O emissions and decreased the ratio of yield-to-GHG emission,
391 which was highest for 150-200 kg N ha⁻¹ y⁻¹ (Feng et al., 2013) very similar results than
392 the observed in our study. Zhong, Wang, Yan & Zhao (2017) observed that the percentage
393 of N lost from leaching, ammonia volatilization and denitrification increased with the N-
394 fertilizer dose in a field experiment in China. Our results also provide evidence that both
395 increased soil N and P availability increased rice yield (Figure S4), even though the N-
396 fertilizer dose was negatively correlated with yield.

397 These results supported the hypothesis that increasing the doses of N fertilizer can
398 have more detrimental than positive effects on yield and GHG productions, even though
399 the availability of N to plants is important and positive for rice production. The results

400 thus strongly suggest a possible N saturation and/or ineffective N fertilization beyond a
401 certain level, with no extra positive effects but mostly negative effects of the higher N
402 input on rice production. Current reports, however, demonstrate an interest to optimize
403 N-fertilization doses in rice crops. Zhu, Zhang, Zhang, Deng & Zhang (2016) reported a
404 decrease in GHG emissions and an increase in rice yield as N-fertilizer doses decreased
405 and plant density increased (~50% increase) in northeastern China. Zhang *et al.* (2016b)
406 similarly demonstrated that the doses of N fertilizer typical of Nanjing paddy fields
407 (China) could be decreased without decreasing rice yield but could decrease GHG
408 emission.

409 Different studies have reported contradictory effects of N fertilization on GHG
410 emissions from rice crops (see the review by Cai, Shan & Xu, 2007). Several studies,
411 however, have observed an increase in N₂O emissions with increases in N-fertilizer dose
412 in rice croplands (Zhang *et al.*, 2014; Kim, Jeong, Kim, Kim & Kim, 2016b).

413 Our data analyses indicated that P- and K-fertilizer doses generally had positive
414 effects on rice yield and decreased GHG productions. The relationships among P- and
415 mainly K-fertilization, yield and GHG productions in rice croplands have not been
416 studied much, as compared to the corresponding relationships with N-fertilization. Our
417 results are nonetheless consistent with other experimental studies (Li *et al.*, 2013; Datta,
418 Santra & Adhya, 2013). Datta, Santra & Adhya (2013) found that N fertilization
419 explained more of the changes in CH₄ emissions than P or K fertilization. In contrast, Li
420 *et al.* (2013) observed that increasing the dose of P fertilizer decreased CH₄ and N₂O
421 emissions but increased yield.

422 However, our study has some potential limitations. The incubation period of three
423 days could not be sufficient to capture the overall patterns of GHG production and
424 emission, and thus has limited reflection of the field condition, but it is still very useful

425 to compare the potential emission among studied sites. In the paddy fields, the first peak
426 of methane emission generally occurs within a month after transplanting, just according
427 with our study. But a second peak would occur at approximately two months and this is
428 mainly governed by the stable low soil redox potential and neutral soil pH, and the
429 increased release of plant-borne carbon sources. (e.g. Ly et al., 2013; Vu et al., 2015).
430 This can be partially corrected by using Xu et al. 2016 method to estimate all year gas
431 emissions. But all in all this can explain why the estimated methane production in this
432 paper is lower than in other reports in Asian countries (Yan et al., 2003; Vo et al., 2018).

433

434 **4.1.Regions, locations and cropping systems**

435 Our results suggest that rice yield can be increased without increasing or even decreasing
436 GHG productions. For example, our results indicated that yields were higher for the
437 japonica than the Hsien varieties. The N₂O productions were several times higher for the
438 Hsien varieties, leading to a better balance between yield and GHG productions in fields
439 with japonica varieties, even though CH₄ productions were clearly higher for the japonica
440 varieties. Adequate irrigation is fundamental for assuring high rice yield (Sun et al., 2016),
441 but our data also suggest that GHG productions can be reduced by regulating doses of N-,
442 P-, and/or K-fertilization. We have also observed that CH₄ and N₂O productions were
443 much higher at sites irrigated and flooded with river water than at sites irrigated and
444 flooded with groundwater or water from superficial reservoirs, whereas average yield did
445 not differ significantly between these sites. This result is difficult to interpret in the
446 context of this study; further studies should aim to find out the cause of these differences.
447 The balance between yield and GHG production was worst in the East China rice crops,
448 with the highest productions of CO₂, CH₄ and N₂O because in this area the temperature
449 is relatively higher, and there are more active substrates (Wang et al., 2015). The North

450 China and Northwest China rice crops had the opposite patterns because in this area the
451 lower temperature limits the substrates decomposition, such as soil organic carbon, and
452 then the microbes act to convert plant residues into humus in the soil (Cui et al., 2008).
453 The lower temperature can decrease decomposition and the CO₂ and CH₄ release from
454 soil by mediating the microbe growth (Tang et al., 2017).

455 Moreover, in these areas paddy soils had relative higher pH and water comes from
456 rivers that can provide more substrate to the paddy and also have longer growth period
457 and more illumination than in other areas of china. Furthermore, the North China and
458 Northwest China rice crops lower greenhouse gases production was related with the
459 higher C:N ratio. The C:N ratio controls the CO₂ and CH₄ release. There is more limited
460 carbon decomposition with relatively higher C:N ratios (Windham, 2001). The soil GHG
461 productions tended to be lower (significantly for CO₂) at inland than coastal sites because
462 he coastal paddy fields had higher carbon and nitrogen concentration, and therefore more
463 substrates for soil GHG productions (Delaune et al., 2018).

464 Moreover, the CO₂ production rates were higher at sites with one annual crop than
465 at sites with two annual crops because the two annual areas, mostly in the south of China,
466 had soils rich in ferric oxide, which, in turn, favored C fixation in soil, and more stable
467 soil carbon, thus decreasing C release in form of methane (Wang et al., 2014).
468 Furthermore, CH₄ production was higher under single crop. Single crop areas had lower
469 temperature during the whole year, thus lowering decomposition, increasing carbon
470 storage in the soil and providing more substrates for CH₄ production when the
471 temperature increases during rice growth period. However, N₂O is higher under double
472 crops because of more applications of N fertilizer.

473 CH₄ production was higher under single crop. Single crop areas had lower
474 temperature during the whole year, thus lower decomposition, and more carbon can be

475 storage in the soil and more substrates is able for CH₄ production when the temperature
476 increase during rice growth period. However, N₂O is higher under double crops, because
477 along the year the N fertilizer applied is in higher amount in the doubles crop areas.

478 Our multivariate analysis of all data from all sites indicated that the highest average
479 yields were accompanied by the highest GHG productions. Optimizing rice production
480 and GHG production is thus interesting and challenging. Our analyses provide some clues
481 for optimization, suggesting that some advances could be achieved by adjusting N-
482 fertilization to a level that improve rice production but avoid the negative effects of
483 excessive N input. Further, GHG productions could be reduced by maintaining adequate
484 levels of P and K fertilizers, mostly at intermediate doses of the current range of P and K
485 fertilization across China, and by re-examining the use of different rice varieties and
486 strategies of water management.

487

488 **5. CONCLUSION**

489 Rice production has historically been improved using N fertilizers, but we found that the
490 current paddy field sites in China with relatively low N fertilization had high rice
491 production and low soil CO₂ and CH₄ potential productions, even though rice yield was
492 positively correlated with soil N availability. In contrast to N fertilization, sites using
493 intermediate doses of P and K fertilizers had the highest rice yields and the lowest soil
494 GHG potential productions. The large capacity of soil to accumulate P in non-available
495 forms and the large capacity of K leaching by the high use of water in rice crops together
496 with a less direct role of P and K in CH₄ and N₂O productions could explain these results.

497 The analysis of all our data strongly suggests that increasing rice yield and
498 minimizing GHG productions can be further optimized in China. The use of different rice
499 varieties and strategies of water management and fertilization with implications for

500 minimizing GHG productions should thus be re-examined.

501

502 **ACKNOWLEDGMENTS**

503 The authors would like to thank Zhu Defeng, Fu Rongfu, Yang Binjuan, Xu Hui, Zhou
504 Jianxia, Liu Jianhui, Huang Jinlong, Chen Chuanbing, Chen Youyang and Chen
505 Xiaoxuan for their assistance with field sampling and laboratory analysis. Funding was
506 provided by the National Science Foundation of China (41571287; 31000209), Research
507 Project of Public Institute of Fujian Province (2018R1034-1), Outstanding Young
508 Research Talents in Higher Education of Fujian Province (2017), Spanish Government
509 grant CGL2016-79835, Catalan Government grant SGR 2017-1005 and European
510 Research Council Synergy grant ERC-SyG-2013-610028, IMBALANCE-P.

511

512 **CONFLICTS OF INTEREST**

513 The authors declare no conflicts of interest.

514

515 **REFERENCES**

516

- 517 Adhya, T. K., Pattnaik, P., Satpathy, S. N., Kumaraswamy, S., & Sethunathan, N. (1998).
518 Influence of phosphorus application on methane emission and production in flooded
519 paddy soils. *Soil Biology and Biochemistry*, 30, 177–181. [https://doi.org/](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0038-0717(97)00104-1)
520 [10.1016/S0038-0717\(97\)00104-1](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0038-0717(97)00104-1)
- 521 Ali, M. A., Oh, J. H., & Kim, P. J. (2008). Evaluation of silicate iron slag amendment on
522 reducing methane emission from flood water rice farming. *Agriculture, Ecosystems*
523 *and Environment*, 128, 21–26. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.agee.2008.04.014>
- 524 Barton, K. (2012). MuM. In: Multi-model inference. R package version 1.7.2.
525 <http://CRAN.R-project.org/package=MuMIn>. at [http://cran.r-project.org/](http://cran.r-project.org/package=MuMIn)
526 [package=MuMIn](http://cran.r-project.org/package=MuMIn)>
- 527 Benjamini, Y., & Hochberg, Y. (1995). Controlling the false discovery rate: a practical
528 and powerful approach to multiple testing. *Journal of the Royal Statistical Society B*,

529 57, 289–300. <http://www.jstor.org/stable/2346101>

530 Cai, Z., Shan, Y., & Xu, H. (2007). Effect of nitrogen fertilization on CH₄ emissions from
531 rice fields. *Soil Science and Plant Nutrition*, 53, 353–361.
532 <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1747-0765.2007.00153.x>

533 Cheng, S.H., & Li, J. (2007). Modern Chinese rice. Beijing: Jindun Press.

534 Cui M, Zhang X, Cai Q, Wang Y, Fan H, & Zhou J. (2008). Relationship between black
535 soil development and climate change and geomorphological evolution in northeast
536 china. *Geographical Research*, 27(3), 527-535. DOI:10.1360/jos172601

537 Datta, A., Santra, S. C., & Adhya, T. K. (2013). Effect of inorganic fertilizers (N, P, K)
538 on methane emission from tropical rice field of India. *Atmospheric Environment*, 66,
539 123–130. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.atmosenv.2012.09.001>

540 Davison, A. C., Hinkley, D. V., & Schechtman, E. (1986). Efficient Bootstrap Simulation.
541 *Biometrika*, 73, 555–566. <https://www.jstor.org/stable/2336519>

542 Delaune, R. D., White, J. R., Elsey-Quirk, T., Roberts, H. H., Wang, D. Q. (2018).
543 Differences in long-term vs short-term carbon and nitrogen sequestration in a
544 coastal river delta wetland: implications for global budgets. *Organic Geochemistry*,
545 123, 67-73. DOI:10.1016/j.orggeochem.2018.06.007

546 Dong, H. B., Yao, Z. S., Zheng, X. H., Mei, B. L., Xie, B. H., Wang, R., Deng, J., Cui,
547 F., & Zhu, J. G. (2011). Effect of ammonium-based, non-sulfate on CH₄ emissions
548 from a paddy field with a typical Chinese water management regime. *Atmospheric*
549 *Environment*, 45, 1095–1101. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.atmosenv.2010.11.039>

550 Fan, X. F., Yu, H. Y., Wu, Q. Y., Ma, J., Xu, H., Yang, J. H., & Zhuang, Y. Q. (2016).
551 Effects of fertilization on microbial abundance and emissions of greenhouse gases
552 (CH₄ and N₂O) in rice paddy fields. *Ecology and Evolution*, 6, 1054–1063. doi:
553 10.1002/ece3.1879

554 FAO [Food and Agricultural Organization of the United Nations]. (2009). OECD-FAO
555 Agricultural Outlook 2011–2030.

556 Feng, J., Chen, C., Zhang, Y., Song, Z., Deng, A., Zheng, C., & Zhang, W. (2013). Impacts
557 of cropping practices on yield-scaled greenhouse gas emissions from rice fields in
558 China: a meta-analysis. *Agriculture Ecosystems and Environment*, 164, 220–228.
559 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.agee.2012.10.009>

560 Fox, J., Nie, Z., & Byrnes, J. (2013). *sem: Structural equation models* (R. package version
561 3.1-1). Retrieved from <http://CRAN.R-project.org/package=sem>

562 Haque, M. M., Kim, S. Y., Ali, M. A., & Kim, P. J. (2015). Contribution of greenhouse

563 gas emissions during cropping and fallow seasons on total global warming potential
564 in mono-rice paddy soils. *Plant and Soil*, 387, 251–264. doi:10.1007/s11104-014-
565 2287-2

566 Hothorn, T., Bretz, F., & Wesrfall, P. (2013). Package “*mulcomp*” (WWW document).
567 U.R.L. <http://cran.stat.sfu.ca/web/packages/mulcomp/mulcomp.pdf>. (accessed
568 19.12.17)

569 Jiang, J. Y., Chen, L. M., Sun, Q., Sang, M. M., & Huang, Y. (2015). Application of
570 herbicides is likely to reduce greenhouse gas (N₂O and CH₄) emissions from rice-
571 wheat cropping systems. *Atmospheric Environment*, 107, 62–69.
572 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.atmosenv.2015.02.029>

573 Kim, G. W., Jeong, S. T., Kim, G. Y., Kim, P. J., & Kim, S. Y. (2016b). Evaluation of
574 carbon dioxide emission factor from urea during rice cropping season: a case study
575 in Korean paddy soil. *Atmospheric Environment*, 139, 139–146.
576 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.atmosenv.2016.05.033>

577 Kim, G. W., Gwon, H. S., Jeong, S. T., Hwang, H. Y., & Kim, P. J. (2016a). Different
578 responses of nitrogen fertilization on methane emission in rice plant included and
579 excluded soils during cropping season. *Agriculture, Ecosystems and Environment*,
580 230, 162–168. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.agee.2016.06.005>

581 Launio, C. C., Asis, C. A., Manalili, R. G., & Javier, E. F. (2016). Cost-effectiveness
582 analysis of farmers’ rice Straw management practices considering CH₄ and N₂O
583 emissions. *Journal of Environmental Management*, 183, 245–252. [https://doi.
584 org/10.1016/j.jenvman.2016.08.015](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jenvman.2016.08.015)

585 Li, C., Salas, W., Deangelo, B., Rose, S. (2006). Assessing alternatives for mitigating net
586 greenhouse gas emissions and increasing yields from rice production in china over
587 the next twenty years. *Journal of Environmental Quality*, 35, 1554–
588 1565. doi:10.2134/jeq2005.0208

589 Li, C. S., Froking, S., Xiao, X. M., Moore, B., Boles, S., Qiu, J. J., Huang, Y., Salas, W.,
590 & Sass, R. (2005). Modeling impacts of farming management alternatives on CO₂,
591 CH₄ and N₂O emissions: A case study for water management of agriculture of China.
592 *Global Biogeochemical Cycles*, 19, GB3010. [https://doi.org/10.1029/
593 2004GB002341](https://doi.org/10.1029/2004GB002341)

594 Li, C. F., Zhang, Z. S., Guo, L. J., Cai, M. L., & Cao, C. G. (2013). Emissions of CH₄ and
595 CO₂ from double rice cropping systems under varying tillage and seedling methods.

596 *Atmospheric Environment*, 80, 438–444. [https://doi.org/10.1016/](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.atmosenv.2013.08.027)
597 [j.atmosenv.2013.08.027](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.atmosenv.2013.08.027)

598 Li, X., Wang, H., Gan, S. H., Jiang, D. Q., Tian, G. M., & Zhang, Z. J. (2013). Eco-
599 stoichiometry alterations in paddy soil ecosystem driven by phosphorus application.
600 *Plos One*, 8, e61141. doi: 10.1371/journal.pone.0061141

601 Liu, Y., Hu, C., Mohamed, I., Wang, J., Zhang, G. S., Li, Z. G., & Chen, F. (2016). Soil
602 CO₂ emissions and drivers in rice-wheat rotation fields subjected to different long-
603 term fertilization practices. *Clean - Soil, Air, Water*, 44, 867–876.
604 <https://doi.org/10.1002/clen.201400478>

605 Ly, P., Jensen, L.S., Bruun, T.B., de Neergaard, A. (2013). Methane (CH₄) and nitrous
606 oxide (N₂O) emissions from the system of rice intensification (SRI) under a rain-fed
607 lowland rice ecosystem in Cambodia. *Nutrient Cycling in Agroecosystems*, 97, 13–
608 27. DOI 10.1007/s10705-013-9588-3.

609 Lu, R. K. (1999). Analysis methods of soil science and agricultural chemistry. Beijing:
610 Agriculture Science and Technology Press.

611 Mishra, U., Ussiri, D. A. N., & Lal, R. (2010). Tillage effects on soil organic carbon
612 storage and dynamics in Corn Belt of Ohio USA. *Soil and Tillage Research*, 107, 88–
613 96. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.still.2010.02.005>

614 Mitchell-Olds, T. (1986). Jackknife, bootstrap and other resampling methods in
615 regression analysis. *Annals of Statistics*, 14, 1316–1318. [https://www.jstor.](https://www.jstor.org/stable/2241454)
616 [org/stable/2241454](https://www.jstor.org/stable/2241454)

617 Myhre, G., Shindell, D., Bréon, F. M., Collins, W., Fuglestedt, J., Huang, J., Koch, D.,
618 Lamarque, J. F., Lee, D., Mendoza, B., Nakajima, T., Robock, A., Stephens, G.,
619 Takemura, T., & Zhang, H. (2013). Anthropogenic and Natural Radiative Forcing. In:
620 Climate Change 2013: The Physical Science Basis. Contribution of Working Group
621 I to the Fifth Assessment Report of the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change
622 [Stocker, T. F., Qin, D., Plattner, G. K., Tignor, M., Allen, S. K., Boschung, J., Nauels,
623 A., Xia, Y., Bex, V., & Midgley, P. M. (eds.)]. Cambridge University Press,
624 Cambridge, United Kingdom and New York, NY, USA. pp 714.

625 Olsson, L., Ye, S., Yu, X., Wei, M., Krauss, K. W., & Brix, H. (2015). Factors influencing
626 CO₂ and CH₄ emissions from coastal wetlands in the Liaohe Delta, Northeast China.
627 *Biogeosciences*, 12, 4965–4977. doi:10.5194/bg-12-4965-2015

628 Pinheiro, J., Bates, D., DebRoy, S., Sarkar, D., & Core, T. R. (2016). *nlme*: Linear and
629 Nonlinear Mixed Effects Models. R *package* version 3.1-126, <http://CRAN>.

630 Raamsdonk, L. M., Teusink, B., Broadhurst, D., Zhang, N. S., Hayes, A., Walsh, M. C.,
631 Berden, J. A., Brudle, K. M., Kell, D. K., Rowland, J. J., Westerhoff, H. V., van Dam,
632 K., & Oliver, S. G. (2001). A functional genomics strategy that uses metabolome data
633 to reveal the phenotype of silent mutations. *Nature Biotechnology*, 19, 45–50.
634 <http://dx.doi.org/10.1038/83496>

635 Revelle, W. (2010). Package “psych.” Retrieved August 24, 2010, from
636 http://personality-project.org/r/psych_manual.pdf

637 Sheng, R., Chen, A. L., Zhang, M. M., Whiteley, A. S., Kumaresan, D., & Wei, W. X.
638 (2016). Transcriptional activities of methanogens and methanotrophs vary with
639 methane emission flux in rice soils under chronic nutrient constraints of phosphorus
640 and potassium. *Biogeosciences*, 13, 6507–6518. doi: 10.5194/bg-13-6507-2016

641 Sun, W., Huang, Y., Zhang, W., & Yu, Y. (2010). Carbon sequestration and its potential
642 in agricultural soils of China. *Global Biogeochemical Cycles*, 24, 1154–1157.
643 <https://doi.org/10.1029/2009GB003484>

644 Sun, H., Zhou, S., Fu, Z., Chen, G., Zou, G., & Song, X. (2016). A two-year field
645 measurement of methane and nitrous oxide fluxes from rice paddies under
646 contrasting climate conditions. *Scientific Reports*, 6, 28255. doi:
647 10.1038/srep28255

648 Tang Q C. (2011). Greenhouse gas emission in China's agriculture: situation and
649 challenge. *China Population, Resources and Environment*, 21(10), 69-75. DOI:
650 10.3969/j.issn.1002-2104.2011.10.011.

651 Tang J, Cheng H, & Fang, C. (2017). The temperature sensitivity of soil organic carbon
652 decomposition is not related to labile and recalcitrant carbon. *Plos One*, 12(11),
653 e0186675. DOI:10.1371/journal.pone.0186675

654 Theint, E. E., Suzuki, S., Ono, E., & Bellingrath-Kimura, S. D. (2014). Influence of
655 different rates of gypsum application on methane emission from saline soil related
656 with rice growth and rhizosphere exudation. *Catena*, 133, 467–473. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.catena.2014.12.003>

657

658 Trinh, M. V., Tesfai, M., Borrell, A., Nagothu, U. S., Bui, T. P. L., Quynh, V. D., &
659 Thanh, L. Q. (2017). Effects of organic, inorganic and slow-release urea fertilizers
660 on CH₄ and N₂O emissions from rice paddy fields. *Paddy and Water Environment*,
661 15, 317–330. doi: 10.1007/s10333-016-0551-1

662 Tukey, John W (1977). *Exploratory Data Analysis*. Addison-Wesley.

663 Vo, T.B.T., Wassmann, R., Tirol-Padre, A., Cao, V.P., MacDonald, B., Espaldon,
664 M.V.O., Sander, B.O. (2018). Methane emission from rice cultivation in different
665 agro-ecological zones of the Mekong river delta: seasonal patterns and emission
666 factors for baseline water management. *Soil Science and Plant Nutrition*, 64, 47–58
667 . <https://doi.org/10.1080/00380768.2017.1413926>

668 Vu, Q.D., de Neergaard, A. Tran, T.D., Hoang, Q.Q., Ly, P., Tran, T.M., Jensen, L.S.
669 (2015). Manure, biogas digestate and crop residue management affects methane gas
670 emissions from rice paddy fields on Vietnamese smallholder livestock farms.
671 *Nutrient Cycling in Agroecosystems*, 103, 329–346 . DOI 10.1007/s10705-015-
672 9746-x

673 Wang, W., Lai, D. Y. F., Li, S. C., Kim, P. J., Zeng, C., Li, P., & Liang, Y. (2014). Steel
674 slag amendment reduces methane emission and increases rice productivity in
675 subtropical paddy fields in China. *Wetlands Ecology and Management*, 22, 683–691.
676 doi: 10.1007/s11273-014-9364-4

677 Wang, W., Wang, C., Sardans, J., Min, Q., Zeng, C., Tong, C., & Peñuelas, J. (2015a).
678 Agricultural land use decouples soil nutrient cycles in a subtropical riparian wetland
679 in China. *Catena*, 133, 171–178. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.catena.2015.05.003>

680 Wang, W., Lai, D. Y. F., Wang, C., Pan, T., & Zeng, C. (2015b). Effects of rice
681 incorporation on active organic carbon pools in a subtropical paddy field. *Soil and*
682 *Tillage Research*, 152, 8–16. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.still.2015.03.011>

683 Wang, W., Lai, D. Y. F., Sardans, J., Wang, C., Datta, A., Pan, T., Zeng, C., Bartrons, M.,
684 & Peñuelas, J. (2015c). Rice straw incorporation affects global warming potential
685 differently in early vs. Late cropping seasons in Southeastern China. *Field Crops*
686 *Research*, 181, 42–51. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.fcr.2015.07.007>

687 Wang, W., Sardans, J., Lai, D.Y.F., Wang, C., Zeng, C., Tong, C., Liang, Y., & Peñuelas,
688 J. (2015d). Effects of steel slag application on greenhouse gas emissions and crop
689 yield over multiple growing seasons in a subtropical paddy field in China. *Field*
690 *Crops Research*, 171, 146–156. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.fcr.2014.10.014>

691 Wang, W., Min, Q., Sardans, J., Wang, C., Asensio, D., Bartrons, M., & Peñuelas, J.
692 (2016a). Organic cultivation of jasmine and tea increases carbon sequestration by
693 changing plant and soil stoichiometry. *Agronomy Journal*, 108, 1–13.
694 doi:10.2134/agronj2015.0559

695 Wang, W., Sardans, J., Zeng, C., Tong, C., Wang, C., & Peñuelas, J. (2016b). Impact of
696 plant invasion and increasing floods on total soil phosphorus and its fractions in the

697 Minjiang River estuarine wetlands, China. *Wetlands*, 36, 21–36. doi: 10.1007/s13157-
698 015-0712-9

699 Wang, W., Wu, X. H., Chen, A. L., Xie, X. L., Wang, Y. Q., & Yin, C. M. (2016c).
700 Mitigating effects of ex situ application of rice straw on CH₄ and N₂O emissions from
701 paddy-upland coexisting system. *Scientific Reports*, 6, 37402. [http://dx.doi.org/](http://dx.doi.org/10.1038/srep37402)
702 [10.1038/srep37402](http://dx.doi.org/10.1038/srep37402)

703 Wang, C., Lai, D. Y. F., Sardans, J., Wang, W. Q., Zeng, C. S., & Peñuelas, J. (2017a).
704 Factors related with CH₄ and N₂O emissions from a paddy field: Clues for
705 management implications. *Plos One*, 12, e0169254. doi: 10.1371/journal.
706 pone.0169254

707 Wang, W., Sardans, J., Wang, C., Zeng, C., Tong, C., Asensio, D., & Peñuelas, J. (2017b).
708 Relationships between the potential production of the greenhouse gases CO₂, CH₄
709 and N₂O and soil concentrations of C, N and P across 26 paddy fields in southeastern
710 China. *Atmospheric Environment*, 164, 458–467.
711 <http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.atmosenv.2017.06.023>

712 Wang, W., Neogi, S., Lai, D. Y. F., Zeng, C., Wang, C., Zeng, D. (2017c). Effects of
713 industrial and agricultural waste amendment on soil greenhouse gas production in a
714 paddy field in southeastern china. *Atmospheric Environment*, 164, 239–249.
715 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.atmosenv.2017.05.052>.

716 Wassmann, R., Neue, H. U., Bueno, C., Lantin, R. S., Alberto, M. C. R., Buendia, L. V.,
717 Bronson, K., Papen, H., & Rennenberg, H. (1998). Methane production capacities of
718 different rice soil derived from inherent and exogenous substrates. *Plant and Soil*,
719 203, 227–237. doi: 10.1023/A:1004357411814

720 Windham, L. (2001). Comparison of biomass production and decomposition between
721 *Phragmites australis* (common reed) and *Spartina patens* (salt hay grass) in brackish
722 tidal marshes of New Jersey, USA. *Wetlands*, 21:179–188.

723 Xu, X., Chen, C., & Xiong, Z. (2016). Effects of biochar and nitrogen fertilizer
724 amendment on abundance and potential activity of methanotrophs and methanogens
725 in paddy field. *Acta Pedologica Sinica*, 53, 1517–1527.
726 DOI:10.11766/trxb201604210087

727 Yan, X., Ohara, T., Akimoto, H. (2003). Development of region-specific emission factors
728 and estimation of methane emission from rice fields in the East, Southeast and South
729 Asian countries. *Global Change Biology*, 9, 237 – 254.

730 Zhang, X., Yin, S., Li, Y., Zhuang, H., Li, C., & Liu, C. (2014). Comparison of greenhouse

731 gas emissions from rice paddy fields under different nitrogen fertilization loads in
732 Chongming Island, Eastern China. *Science of the Total Environment*, 472, 381–388.
733 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2013.11.014>

734 Zhang, G. B., Yu, H. Y., Fan, X. F., Yang, Y. T., Ma, J., & Xu, H. (2016a). Drainage and
735 tillage practices in the winter fallow season mitigate CH₄ and N₂O emissions from a
736 double-rice field in China. *Atmospheric Chemistry & Physics*, 16, 11853–11866.
737 doi:10.5194/acp-16-11853-2016

738 Zhang, Z. S., Chen, J., Liu, T. Q., Cao, C. G., & Li, C. F. (2016b). Effects of nitrogen
739 fertilizer sources and tillage practices on greenhouse gas emissions in paddy fields of
740 central China. *Atmospheric Environment*, 144, 274–281. [https://doi.org/](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.atmosenv.2016.09.003)
741 [10.1016/j.atmosenv.2016.09.003](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.atmosenv.2016.09.003)

742 Zhao, Z., Yue, Y. B., Sha, Z. M., Li, C. S., Deng, J., Zhang, H. L., Gao, M. F., & Cao, L.
743 K. (2015). Assessing impacts of alternative fertilizer management practices on both
744 nitrogen loading and greenhouse gas emissions in rice cultivation. *Atmospheric*
745 *Environment*, 119, 393–401. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.atmosenv.2015.08.060>

746 Zheng, Y., Zhang, L. M., & He, J. Z. (2013). Immediate effects of nitrogen, phosphorus,
747 and potassium amendments on the methanotrophic activity and abundance in a
748 Chinese paddy soil under short-term incubation experiment. *Journal of Soils and*
749 *Sediments*, 13, 189–196. doi: 10.1007/s11368-012-0601-2

750 Zhong, Y., Wang, X., Yang, J., & Zhao, X. (2017). Tracing the fate of nitrogen with ¹⁵N
751 isotope considering suitable fertilizer rate related to yield and environmental impacts
752 in paddy field. *Paddy and Water Environment*, 15, 943–949. doi: 10.1007/s10333-
753 017-0606-y

754 Zhu, X., Zhang, J., Zhang, Z., Deng, A., & Zhang, W. (2016). Dense planting with less
755 basal nitrogen fertilization might benefit rice cropping for high yield with less
756 environmental impacts. *European Journal of Agronomy*, 75, 50–59. [https://doi.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.eja.2016.01.003)
757 [org/10.1016/j.eja.2016.01.003](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.eja.2016.01.003)

758 Zhu, T. B., Zhang, J. B., & Cai, Z. C. (2011). The contribution of nitrogen transformation
759 processes to total N₂O emissions from soils used for intensive vegetable cultivation.
760 *Plant and Soil*, 343, 313–327. doi: 10.1007/s11104-011-0720-3

761 Zhu. (2006). System of rice intensification. Beijing: China Agricultural Science and
762 Technology Press.

763

764

765

766 **Figures**

767 **Figure 1.** Locations of the field sites for soil sampling across China.

768 **Figure 2.** Rice yield and total accumulated productions of CO₂, CH₄ and N₂O for the N-
769 fertilizer annual doses (low < 96 kg ha⁻¹, intermediate 96-140 kg ha⁻¹, high more than 140
770 kg ha⁻¹). Different letters indicate significant statistical differences ($P < 0.05$).

771 **Figure 3.** Rice yield and total accumulated productions of CO₂, CH₄ and N₂O for the P-
772 fertilization annual doses (low < 62 kg ha⁻¹, intermediate 72-92 kg ha⁻¹, high more than
773 72 kg ha⁻¹). Different letters indicate significant statistical differences ($P < 0.05$).

774 **Figure 4.** Rice yield and total accumulated productions of CO₂, CH₄ and N₂O for the K-
775 fertilizer annual doses (low < 70 kg ha⁻¹, intermediate 71-81 kg ha⁻¹, high more than 81
776 kg ha⁻¹). Different letters indicate significant statistical differences ($P < 0.05$).

777 **Figure 5.** Rice yield and total accumulated productions of CO₂, CH₄ and N₂O in the
778 various regions. Different letters indicate significant statistical differences ($P < 0.05$).

779 **Figure 6.** Rice yield and total accumulated productions of CO₂, CH₄ and N₂O at inland
780 vs coastal sites. Different letters indicate significant statistical differences ($P < 0.05$).

781 **Figure 7.** Rice yield and total accumulated productions of CO₂, CH₄ and N₂O at sites
782 with one vs two rice crops. Different letters indicate significant statistical differences
783 ($P < 0.05$). Different letters between brackets indicate marginal significant statistical
784 differences ($P < 0.1$).

785 **Figure 8.** First two PC axes of the PCA of all soil variables, GHG productions and yield
786 showing the areas (95% confidence intervals) occupied by sites with the N-, P- and K-
787 fertilizer doses (A), the areas (95% confidence intervals) occupied by sites in the various
788 regions (B), showing the areas (95% confidence intervals) occupied by sites for the inland

789 vs coastal locations (C) and showing the areas (95% confidence intervals) occupied by
790 sites with one vs two rice crops (D). The Acronyms mean: CO₂ rate= CO₂ productions
791 rate, CH₄ rate= CH₄ productions rate, N₂O rate= N₂O productions rate, [C]=Soil C
792 concentration, [N] = Soil N concentration, [P] = Soil P concentration, NH₄= Soil NH₄⁺
793 concentration, NO₃= Soil NO₃⁻ concentration, NO₃cont= Soil NO₃⁻ content, LOC= Soil
794 labile organic carbon concentration, P avai= Total soil available P concentration,
795 Sand=Percentage in weight of sand in dry soil, Clay= Percentage in weight of clay in dry
796 soil, pH=Soil pH, Water=Soil water content, salinity=Soil salinity, Bulkd=Soil bulk
797 density, Yield=Rice crop yield, MAP=Mean Annual Precipitation, MAT=Mean Annual
798 Temperature.

799 **Figure 9.** SEM models with soil CO₂ production rate (A), soil accumulate CO₂ production
800 (B) and rice crop yield (C) as end endogen variables. Numbers on the arrows are the
801 estimates of the effects of one variable (near the beginning of the arrow) over another
802 (near the end of the arrow) and the corresponding *P* values (in parentheses). Red arrows
803 indicate negative relationships, and black arrows indicate positive relationships.